



To: Kristine Johnston

From: Karen Smith

Date: April 8, 2016

Re: **Employee Basic Life/AD&D Insurance and Employee, Spouse, Child
Optional Life/AD&D Insurance, Request for Proposal #16-02-4884RFP
Contract Award Recommendation**

The District issued a Request for Proposal (RFP) to secure a vendor for Basic Life/Accidental Death and Dismemberment (AD&D), Optional Life and Dependent Optional Life Insurance. Currently, Optional Life and Dependent Optional Life Insurance do not include AD&D. Most school districts in the area include AD&D with their Optional Life and Dependent Optional Life Insurance; therefore, the District requested vendors propose with and without AD&D.

Proposals were received from the incumbent insurance company Sun Life as well as Aetna, Dearborn National, Hartford Life, MetLife, Minnesota Life, Symetra, The Standard and Voya. The proposals varied greatly in their terms and premiums. Attached is the evaluation of proposals based on the RFP criteria for your review.

I recommend the District accept the proposal which includes AD&D from Voya. The proposal reflects an increase in the District provided Basic Life/AD&D insurance of \$132,936. In addition to adding AD&D to Optional Life and Dependent Optional Life, Optional Life coverage will increase from a maximum of \$250,000 to a maximum of \$500,000. The cost of both the Optional Life and Dependent Optional Life Insurance is paid by the employee.

Feel free to contact me if you have any questions. Thank you.

Cc: Stuart Snow
Matt Morgan
Mark Flores

Cypress-Fairbanks ISD

Prepared by: Gary W. Journey
 Effective Date: September 1, 2016

**Best and Final Bid Evaluation
 (Adding Optional Life AD&D)**



Evaluation Criteria <i>(With Optional AD&D)</i>	CURRENT Sun Life	RENEWAL Sun Life	Proposal 1 Aetna	Proposal 2 Dearborn National	Proposal 3 Hartford	Proposal 4 MetLife	Proposal 5 Minnesota Life	Proposal 6 Symetra	Proposal 7 The Standard	Proposal 8 Voya
	Sun Life	Sun Life	Aetna	Dearborn National	Hartford	MetLife	Minnesota Life	Symetra	The Standard	Voya
Basic Life Annualized Cost	\$239,268	\$638,064	\$505,128	\$590,208	\$616,800	\$521,088	\$542,352	\$515,772	\$377,520	\$372,204
<i>Basic Life Difference from Current Annualized Cost</i>	--	<i>\$398,796</i>	<i>\$265,860</i>	<i>\$350,940</i>	<i>\$377,532</i>	<i>\$281,820</i>	<i>\$303,084</i>	<i>\$276,504</i>	<i>\$138,252</i>	<i>\$132,936</i>
Optional Life Annualized Cost	\$1,144,008	\$1,652,436	\$1,473,708	\$1,368,828	\$1,355,172	\$1,808,256	\$1,442,280	\$1,365,648	\$1,526,532	\$1,370,436
<i>Optional Life Difference from Current Annualized Cost</i>	--	<i>\$508,428</i>	<i>\$329,700</i>	<i>\$224,820</i>	<i>\$211,164</i>	<i>\$664,248</i>	<i>\$298,272</i>	<i>\$221,640</i>	<i>\$382,524</i>	<i>\$226,428</i>
TOTAL COST	\$1,383,276	\$2,290,500	\$1,978,836	\$1,959,036	\$1,971,972	\$2,329,344	\$1,984,632	\$1,881,420	\$1,904,052	\$1,742,640
<i>TOAL COST DIFFERENCE FROM CURRENT</i>	--	<i>\$907,224</i>	<i>\$595,560</i>	<i>\$575,760</i>	<i>\$588,696</i>	<i>\$946,068</i>	<i>\$601,356</i>	<i>\$498,144</i>	<i>\$520,776</i>	<i>\$359,364</i>
Overall Cost Proposed - 50%	N/A	38%	44%	45%	44%	37%	44%	46%	46%	50%
Support Services Quoted - 15%	N/A	15%	15%	15%	15%	15%	15%	15%	15%	15%
References - 15%	N/A	15%	15%	15%	15%	15%	15%	15%	15%	15%
Compliance with the RFP - 10%	N/A	10%	9%	10%	9%	9%	7%	8%	10%	10%
Experience - Political Subdivisions - 10%	N/A	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%
WEIGHTED OVERALL	CURRENT	Sun Life	Aetna	Dearborn National	Hartford	MetLife	Minnesota Life	Symetra	The Standard	Voya
	N/A	88%	93%	95%	93%	86%	91%	94%	96%	100%

